

DETROIT LIBRARY COMMISSION PROCEEDINGS

**SPECIAL MEETING
JULY 24, 2019
5:30 P.M.**

President Adams called the Special Meeting of the Detroit Library Commission to order at 5:35 p.m.

Present: President Adams, Commissioners Bellant, Inniss-Edwards, Friley, Smith Gray, Jackson, Taylor (Ex-Officio)

Administrative Staff: Mondowney, Brown, Funchess, Johnson, Norfolk, Powell, Simmons, Williams

Present Also: Deborah Dorsey, Christina Ladson, Carolyn Mosley, Yvette Rice Tiffani Simon,

NOTED

President Adams stated that the agenda for the meeting that was sent to the Commissioners did not match the meeting notice that was posted on DPL's website, which was a summary of the agenda items. President Adams stated that she had a conversation with Mr. Tony Jenkins and Mr. George Butler, DPL's Legal Counsel, regarding the requirements for the posting of a special meeting. Mr. Jenkins and Mr. Butler advised that the agenda for the meeting did not have to be posted, however, the date, time and location of the meeting had to be posted, which was posted on DPL's website and in the public.

COMMISSION ACTION

Commissioner Bellant moved to approve the revised agenda. Commissioner Friley supported. The motion carried.

COMMISSION ACTION

President Adams moved to amend the agenda to move the closed session action items from the beginning of the agenda to the end. Commissioner Friley supported. The motion carried.

Minutes were approved at the September 17, 2019 Commission Meeting

Approval to Renew the Executive Director's Contract**DISCUSSION**

Commissioner Smith Gray asked why the contract renewal was for two-years with a third-year renewal option instead of a straight three-year contract?

COMMISSION ACTION

Commissioner Inniss-Edwards moved to table the discussion to approve the renewal of the Executive Director's contract and to enter into a closed session. Commissioner Bellant supported.

A roll call vote was taken with the following results:

Commissioner Bellant	Yes
Commissioner Inniss-Edwards	Yes
Commissioner Friley	Yes
Commissioner Gray	Yes
Commissioner Jackson	Yes
Commissioner Taylor	Yes
President Adams	Yes

The closed session began at 5:45 p.m.

Upon a motion by President Adams and supported by Commissioner Inniss-Edwards, the closed session ended at 6:28 p.m.

The Special Commission meeting reconvened at 6:28 p.m.

COMMISSION ACTION

Commissioner Edwards moved approval of the Executive Director's contract renewal for two-years with a third-year renewal option and to remove the words succession planning from the verbiage in the performance goals. Commissioner Bellant supported. Commissioner Gray opposed. The motion carried

NOTED

Commissioner Gray stated that the Executive Director's contract should be for three straight years.

Minutes were approved at the September 17, 2019 Commission Meeting

Approval to Contract with the Hawkins Company to Conduct an Executive Search firm a Chief of Operations and Customer Experience Officer for the Detroit Public Library

A request was made by the Office of the Executive Director to secure a contract with a company to conduct an Executive Search for a Chief of Operations and Customer Experience Officer for Detroit Public Library.

A Request for Proposal (RFP), #DPL-CL-1909, was issued on March 15, 2019. All proposals were due to the Procurement Department by 2:00 p.m. on April 4, 2019.

The Procurement Department received a total of four (4) proposals in response to the RFP. The evaluation committee reviewed the proposals submitted and scored each proposal based upon the following criteria:

<i>Criteria</i>	<i>Possible Points</i>
Completeness and Quality of Response	20
Ability to Provide the Requested Services	20
Experience with Public Libraries	20
Expertise of Key Personnel	15
Cost	15
Experience	10

The evaluation results are as follows:

Supplier	Cost	J. Mondowney	T. Moore	Total Score	Average Score
The Hawkins Company	\$39,250.00	97	93	190	95
The Hunter Group	\$37,500.00	68	69	137	68.5
Gov HR USA	\$24,500.00	43	49	82	41
Amy Cell	\$9,000.00	25	30	55	27.5

After review of the proposals, The Hawkins Group received the highest-ranked score. This company has extensive experience in recruiting for executive positions for public libraries throughout the country. The evaluation scores reflect the company's level of expertise in conducting this search on behalf of Detroit Public Library.

The Evaluation Committee is recommending approval of a contract with the highest-ranked proposal: **The Hawkins Company, 8939 S. Sepulveda Blvd., Suite 110-216, Los Angeles, CA 90045 in an amount not to exceed \$39,250.**

Minutes were approved at the September 17, 2019 Commission Meeting

COMMISSION ACTION

Commissioner Taylor moved approval. Commissioner Jackson supported.

DISCUSSION

Commissioner Inniss-Edwards stated that the process for presenting information from the Professional Services contracts to the Commission should be reviewed. The scope of work should have the exact verbiage that was in the original Request for Bid.

Commissioner Bellant stated he was uncomfortable with approving the contact because of the title, Chief of Operations and Customer Experience Officer. He said the title overlaps the Executive Director's responsibilities.

President Adams stated that the Executive Director provided the title and it is in keeping with the industry's standards.

COMMISSION ACTION CONT'D

The motion passed unanimously.

Approval for the Removal and Installation of Condenser Pumps at the Main Library

The Facilities Department contacted the Heating and Cooling Maintenance and Repair Contractor, Johnson Controls, to provide a quote for replacing the condenser pumps at Main Branch. The pumps are a component of the cooling system and are no longer functioning. Additionally, the repair of these pumps are outside of the scope for regular maintenance and repair of the system. The quote submitted by Johnson Controls on June 11, 2019 estimated the cost of the repairs at \$81,994.00. Given the cost, the Procurement Department completed a quick bid for Labor, Materials and Equipment for the Removal and Installation of the Condenser Pumps. The emergency repair cost requires an amendment to the FY2019/2020 Capital Outlay budget.

An Invitation for Bid (IFB), IFB-CL-1927, was posted on DPL's website and sent to the MITN (Michigan Inter-Governmental Trade Network) on June 13, 2019. The solicitation period was from June 13, 2019 until bid closing at 2:00 p.m. on June 25, 2019, at which time the bid documents were no longer available for download. The bid was downloaded from the MITN website by fifteen (15) contractors. Seven (7) companies attended the mandatory walk-thru and two companies submitted a bid on the project, as follows:

1. Alpha Mechanical Services Group 33200 Schoolcraft, #12 Livonia, MI 48150	\$77,000
2. Johnson Controls 2875 High Meadow Circle Auburn Hills, MI 48326	\$101,265

Due to the emergency nature of this procurement, the Procurement Department received authorization from the Executive Director to proceed with issuing the purchase order to the lowest qualified bidder, Alpha Mechanical Services Group. Therefore, the Procurement Department is requesting ratification of the purchase to Alpha Mechanical Services Group for a total cost not to exceed \$77,000.

In addition, the Finance department is requesting approval to increase the FY2019/2020 Capital Outlay budget by \$77,000 to cover the emergency repair. If approved, the fund balance would decrease to \$25,010,008.

NOTED

Commissioner Bellant stated the Committee on Buildings and the Committee on Finance had not been given any advanced notice regarding approval of the condenser pumps, AHU chiller coils, roof replacement and paving services at Knapp Branch and they were listed on the write-ups.

COMMISSION ACTION

Commissioner Bellant moved approval. Commissioner Jackson supported. President Adams made a friendly amendment to the motion:
Remove the Committee names and titles from all of the write-ups.
The motion passed unanimously.

Approval for the Replacement of the AHU Coils at the Main Library

The Facilities Department contacted the Heating and Cooling Maintenance and Repair Contractor, Johnson Controls, to provide a quote for replacing the AHU chiller coils at Main Branch. The coils of the AHU Units, E-1A and E-3 in the basement and Print Shop of the building. The coils are a component of the cooling system and are no longer functioning. Additionally, the replacement of these coils are outside of the scope for regular maintenance and repair of the system. The quote submitted by Johnson Controls on June 11, 2019 estimated the cost at \$198,850.00. Given the cost, the Procurement Department completed a quick bid to provide labor, materials and equipment for the replacement of AHU chiller coils at Main Library. The emergency repair cost requires an amendment to the FY2019/2020 Capital Outlay budget.

Minutes were approved at the September 17, 2019 Commission Meeting

An Invitation for Bid (IFB), IFB-CL-1926, was posted on DPL's website and sent to the MITN (Michigan Inter-Governmental Trade Network) on June 13, 2019. The solicitation period was from June 13, 2019 until bid closing at 2:00 p.m. on June 25, 2019, at which time the bid documents were no longer available for download. The bid was downloaded from the MITN website by twelve (12) contractors. Eight (8) contractors attended the mandatory site visit and two (2) companies submitted bids on the project, as follows:

Alpha Mechanical Services Group 33200 Schoolcraft, Ste 12 Livonia, MI 48150	\$65,000
---	----------

Johnson Controls, Inc. 2875 High Meadow Circle Auburn Hills, MI 48326	\$199,900
---	-----------

The Facilities Department reviewed all of the bids submitted. The bid from Alpha Mechanical Services Group of Livonia, MI, in the amount of \$65,000, was the lowest acceptable bidder to complete this project. Due to the emergency nature of this procurement, the Procurement Department received authorization from the Executive Director to proceed with issuing the purchase order to the lowest qualified bidder, Alpha Mechanical Services Group. An additional \$4,500 was paid for an expedited two (2) weeks delivery because the standard lead time for the coils is four to five weeks. Therefore, the Procurement Department is requesting ratification of the purchase to Alpha Mechanical Services Group for a total cost not to exceed \$69,500.

In addition, the Finance department is requesting approval to increase the FY2019/2020 Capital Outlay Budget by \$69,500 to cover the emergency repair. If approved, the fund balance would decrease to \$24,940,583.

COMMISSION ACTION

Commissioner Bellant moved approval. Commissioner Gray supported. The motion passed unanimously.

COMMISSION ACTION

Commissioner Inniss-Edwards moved to add the legal matter and the negotiated salary increase to the agenda for approval before the adjournment of the meeting. These items were discussed in closed session. Commissioner Bellant approved. The motion passed unanimously.

Approval of the Roof Repair at Main Library –New Edition

The roof on the new edition of Main Library is the original roof installed in 1963. Due to the age of the roof, additional repairs to the numerous leaks and holes would be a futile effort. The Facilities Department is seeking approval of a contract to provide Labor, Materials and Equipment for the replacement of the roof. The Procurement Department identified the cooperative agreement under OMNIA Contract #14-5903 (formerly US Communities) by which DPL would partner with Garland Roofing Company to complete the project. Under the agreement, Garland Roofing Company would provide an initial assessment, materials, engineering services and oversee the construction management to ensure proper installation of the Garland Roof Replacement system. Because of the state of the roof, DPL desired that bids include a completion date prior to November 15, 2019. The cost of replacing the roof would require an amendment to the FY 2019/2020 Capital Outlay Budget, as it was not a part of the original budget.

The labor portion of the Roof Replacement was bid under Invitation for Bid, IFB-CL-1930. and the removal and installation of condenser pumps at Main Library. The Invitation for Bid (IFB), IFB-CL-1930, was posted on DPL's website and sent to the MITN (Michigan Inter-Governmental Trade Network) on June July 1, 2019. The solicitation period was from July 1, 2019 until bid closing at 2:00 p.m. on July 17, 2019, at which time the bid documents were no longer available for download. The bid was downloaded from the MITN website by sixteen (16) contractors. Six (6) companies attended the mandatory walk-thru and five (5) companies submitted a bid on the project. DPL requested each company to submit a bid on the roofing replacement utilizing Cold Applied materials (highest cost lowest VOC) and two alternate bids for Heat Applied materials (mid-range cost and Mid-VOC) and Hot Kettle materials (lowest cost and highest VOC). The bids submitted are as follows:

		Base Bid	Alternate #1	Alternate #2
3.	Royal Roofing 2445 Brown Road Orion, MI 48359	\$1,370,900.00	\$1,399,900.00	\$1,387,900.00
4.	Schena Roofing & Sheet Metal 28299 Kehrig Drive Chesterfield, MI 48047	\$1,536,900.00	NO BID	NO BID <i>*Cannot meet completion date of November 15th</i>
5.	Lutz Roofing Company, Inc. 4721 22 Mile Road Shelby Twp, MI 48317	\$1,193,000.00	\$1,263,000.00	\$1,210,000.00
6.	LaDuke Roofing & Sheet Metal 10311 Capital Oak Park, MI 48237	\$976,420.00	\$973,600.00	\$969,600.00
7.	Schreiber Corporation 29945 Beck Road Wixom, MI 48393	\$1,132,000.00	\$1,141,000.00	\$1,110,000.00 <i>*Cannot meet completion date of November 15th</i>

The Library elected to go with the mid-range bids. The total cost for the roof replacement, including all materials, are as follows:

		Alternate #1	+ Materials	Total Cost
1.	Royal Roofing 2445 Brown Road Orion, MI 48359	\$1,399,900.00	\$1,189,756.44	\$2,589,656.44
2.	Schena Roofing & Sheet Metal NO BID 28299 Kehrig Drive Chesterfield, MI 48047		*Cannot meet completion date of November 15th	
3.	Lutz Roofing Company, Inc. 4721 22 Mile Road Shelby Twp, MI 48317	\$1,263,000.00	\$1,147,769.95	\$2,410,769.95
4.	LaDuke Roofing & Sheet Metal 10311 Capital Oak Park, MI 48237	\$973,600.00	\$1,103,808.91	\$2,077,408.91
5.	Schreiber Corporation 29945 Beck Road Wixom, MI 48393	\$1,141,000.00	\$1,063,448.94	\$2,204,448.94
			*Cannot meet completion date of November 15th	

The bid from LaDuke Roofing & Sheet Metal, in the total amount of \$2,077,408.91, lowest, responsive and responsible bidder qualified to complete this project. Therefore, the Procurement Department is recommending approval of the contract for a total amount of \$2,077,408.91. The Finance Department is also requesting approval to increase the FY2019/2020 Capital Outlay Budget by \$2,077,408.91 to cover the expense. If approved, the fund balance would decrease to \$25,087,083.

COMMISSION ACTION

Commissioner Bellant moved approval. Commissioner Jackson supported. The motion passed unanimously.

NOTED

Commissioner Gray inquired if the company was responsible for interior damage if the roof leaked within the thirty-year warranty period. Ms. Christina Ladson, Procurement Manager, stated that she would investigate and send a response to the Commissioners.

Approval of the Paving Services at the Knapp Branch

The Facilities Department is seeking approval to initiate Paving Services at Knapp Branch. Hutch Paving provided a quote to complete the required services, in accordance the awarded contract issued to the company in, as a result of IFB-CL-1920. The total amount for this project is:

\$32,856 – Quote
-\$4,256 – Discount
\$28,600 - Total Cost

The Facilities Department is requesting approval to proceed with the project, as quoted by Hutch Paving for a total cost not to exceed \$28,600.

COMMISSION ACTION

Commissioner Bellant moved approval. Commissioner Jackson supported. The motion passed unanimously.

Approval of a Legal Matter

Commissioner Taylor moved to accept the legal recommendation as presented. Commissioner Jackson supported. The motion passes unanimously.

Approval to Implement the Negotiated Salary Increases Resulting from Wage Re-Openers for AFSCME 1259 and AFSCME 1231, Local 2200-UAW Association of Professional Librarians (APL), the Professional Organization of Librarians (POOL) and the Skilled Trade Unit (STU).

Consistent with the terms of the respective Collective Bargaining Agreements, Management and the leadership of AFSCME 1259, AFSCME 1231, and all of the units of UAW - Local 2022 conducted wage re-opener sessions beginning April 25, 2019 through June 4, 2019.

Management was able to successful negotiate a 3% increase which is consistent with the 2019 total median increase locally and across all employee categories and industries in the U.S. Furthermore, Management gained support and consideration by providing a detailed overview of DPL's budget commitments including, pensions, tax captures, facilities improvements and operating costs.

The union membership ratified the proposed increase as follows:

- AFSCME 1259 ratified the 3% wage agreement on May 13, 2019.
- AFSCME 1231 ratified the 3% wage agreement on May 31, 2019.
- UAW POOL/APL/STU - Local 2220 ratified the 3% wage increase on June 14, 2019.

This completes the process for wage-re-openers for AFSCME and UAW for FY 2019/2020.

Subsequent to ratification by the unions, non-union employees customarily receive the same percentage wage increase.

All salary increases are effective July 1, 2019.

Management is requesting Commission approval for the wage increases. The total cost of the wage increases for July 1, 2019 are: \$422,025

1	AFSCME 1259 - 3%	\$98,011
2	AFSCME 1231 - 3%	\$69,189
3	UAW APL - 3%	\$57,940
4	UAW STU - 3%	\$14,768
5	UAW POOL - 3%	\$88,269
6	Non-Union Employees - 3%	\$88,876
7	IUOE - 2%	\$4,972
TOTAL		<u>\$422,025</u>

COMMISSION ACTION

Commissioner Bellant moved approval. Commissioner Friley supported. The motion passed unanimously.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:55 p.m.